OAS ICHR

## UNCLASSIFIED

Santiago Canton Executive Secretary Inter-American Commission on Human Rights Organisation of American States 1889- F Street, N.W. Washington D.C. 20006

KLJE

•••

**RELEASED IN FULL** 

5 March 2002

Dear Sir

Center for Constitutional Rights, Center for Justice and International Law and Others Request for Precautionary Measures

We refer to Request for Precautionary Measures filed with the Commission on the 25 February 2002.

Enclosed please find Observations to Precautionary Measures. In addition, the following individuals and institutions would like to join as petitioners after carefully reviewing the petition for precautionary measures filed on behalf on the detainees on Guatanamo on February 25, 2002.

Stephen Solly

Stephen Solley QC Ben Cooper The Bar Council Human Rights Committee of England and Wales 10-11 Gray's Inn Square Gray's Inn London, WC1R 5JD United Kingdom Telephone: 44 (0)207 395 9508

Garen (Purce

Gareth Peirce Birnberg Peirce and Partners Solicitors 14 Inverness Street Camden Town London, NW1 7HJ In United Kingdom Telephone: 44 (0)207 911 0166

and Christian

Louise Christian Christian Fisher Solicitors 42 Museum Street Bloomsbury London, WCIA 1LY United Kingdom Telephone: 44 (0)207 831 1750

the kaba

Sidiki Kaba, President Antoine Bernard, Executive Director Jeanne Sulzer, International Justice Program Officer International Federation for Human Rights – FIDH 17, passage de la main d'or 75011 Paris France Telephone: (33) 1 43 55 25 18

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF STATE REVIEW AUTHORITY: HARRY R MELONE DATE/CASE ID: 02 DEC 2004 200303827 ACLU-RDI 4172 p.1

UNCLASSIFIED

DOS-001788

Petitioners submitted a Request for Precautionary Measures in the above matter on 25 February, 2002. Following submission of this document, Petitioners consider it necessary to clarify certain matters raised therein and do so in the following Observations:

- 1. At page 8 of the Petition, Petitioners refer to a newspaper article in which the International Committee of the Red Cross are [is] quoted as saying that a "court" has to make any decision on prisoner-of-war status. Petitioners wish to clarify with this Commission that they realize that pursuant to the Third Geneva Convention it is a "competent tribunal" rather than a "court" that is required to make such a decision. The newspaper article possibly misquoted what the ICRC said.
- 2. At page 13 of the Petition, Petitioners note "the military commissions fail to provide minimal guarantees of due process." From various press reports,<sup>1</sup> Petitioners are aware that the United States is considering passing regulations pursuant to section 4(b) of the Military Order that could possibly improve the procedural protections afforded by such commissions. From the information available however, Petitioners do not consider that these improvements will rectify the fundamental defects of the Order.
- 3. Finally, in regards to issues raised on the status of those detained, Petitioners wish to clarify with this Commission that should the United States refuse to recognize those persons detained as prisoners-of-war under the Third Geneva Convention then they should be recognized as civilians pursuant to the Fourth Geneva Convention and not as "unlawful combatants".<sup>2</sup> Petitioners contend, contrary to the position of the United States, that international humanitarian law does not recognize such a status.

Respectfully submitted:

March 5, 2002

ACLU-RDI 4172 p.2

<sup>1</sup> See e.g. Katharine Q. Scelye, *Draft Rules for Tribunals Ease Worries, but Not All*, The New . York Times, December 29, 2001 available at http://www.crimelynx.com/draftease.html

<sup>2</sup> See: Delalic et al. (I.T -96-21) "Celebici", Judgment of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (16 November 1998), para. 271

UNCLASSIFIED

**DOS-001789** 

Ø]025

UNCLASSIFIED

audra Couver

andra Coliver Joshua Sondheimer Center for Justice & Accountability 870 Market St., Suite 684 San Francisco, CA 94102 Telephone: (415) 544-0444

pa) William J. Aceves

Associate Professor of Law California Western School of Law 225 Cedar Street San Diego, CA 92101 Telephone:(619) 525-1589

Kogen Normand

pA Roger-Normand, Executive Director The Center for Economic and Social Rights 162 Montague St. Second Floor Brooklyn, New York, NY 11201 Telephone: (718) 237 9145

Phillips

Robin Phillips, Acting Executive Director Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights 310 Fourth Avenue South Suite 1000 Minneapolis, MN 55401 Telephone: (612) 341-3301

Kindly acknowledge receipt.

Sincerely,

ACLU-RDI 4172 p.3

PAJEssifren Ween Center for Constitutional Rights

Ralph G. Steinhardt

Arthur Selwyn Miller Research Professor of Law Co-Director, Oxford Programme in International Human Rights Law The George Washington University Law School Burns 421 2000 H Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20052

Telephone: (202) 994-573

pp Bert Wich wood

Distinguished Service, Professor of Law and Director, Urban Morgan Institute for Human Rights University of Cincinnati College of Law Cincinnati, Ohio 45221-0040 Telephone: (513)556-0068

David Weissbrodt

Fredrikson & Byron Professor of Law and Co-Director, Human Rights Center University of Minnesota [but not signing on behalf of the University of Minnesota] 229-19th Avenue South Minneapolis, MN 55455 Telephone: (612) 625-5027

Jurnes J. Silk Deena R. Hurwitz Allard K. Lowenstein International Human Rights Law Clinic Yale Law School P.O. Box 208215 New Haven, CT 06520-8215 Telephone: (203) 432-7480

Yoxanna CE

enter for Justice and International Law

DOS-001790

**UNCLASSIFIED**