

Tillery, Monica J

**From:** Harris, Robert K  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 01, 2004 1:34 PM  
**To:** Dolan, JoAnn; Legal-L-HRR-dl; Dorosin, Joshua L  
**Cc:** Cummings, Edward R (Main State); Witten, Samuel M  
**Subject:** FW: NGO's

SL83

JoAnn and Josh,

B5

Thanks.

Bob

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Malione, Tom V  
**Sent:** Friday, August 27, 2004 9:48 AM  
**To:** Alder, Lois L; Blanck Jr, John I; Cook, Daphne W; Dalton, Robert E; Dennis, Michael J; Dolan, JoAnn; Haines, Avril D; Ingber, Rebecca M; Legal-L-HRR-dl; Peay, T Michael  
**Subject:** NGO's

UNCLASSIFIED per E.O. 12958

Reuters.com, August 26, 2004

## Pentagon Opposes Independent Prison Abuse Probe

By Will Dunham, Reuters

WASHINGTON - The Pentagon on Thursday opposed calls for an independent investigation of prisoner abuse from human rights groups and a key congressional Democrat, who said such a probe was the only way to get to the truth.

Amnesty International and Human Rights Watch called for an independent investigation into U.S. prisoner detention and interrogation operations after two Pentagon reports this week greatly expanded the scope of culpability in the prisoner abuse scandal.

"The investigations either completed or under way and the rigorous oversight by Congress provide the department and the public a thorough examination of the facts," said Matt Waxman, deputy assistant secretary of defense for detainee affairs.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
REVIEW AUTHORITY: HARRY R MELONE  
DATE/CASE ID: 16 DEC 2004 200303827

1

UNCLASSIFIED

DOS-001761

## UNCLASSIFIED

Waxman said in a statement existing Pentagon inquiries "have put detention operations under a microscope."

"What's needed now is not another investigation but time for the justice system to work its will and for the department to continue its efforts to improve detention operations."

Alistair Hodgett, spokesman for Amnesty International USA, said no investigation conducted since the revelations that U.S. forces abused and sexually humiliated Iraqis at Abu Ghraib jail had been free to take a full look at who was responsible for the abuse and what caused it. Not one of the "patchwork of reports" had examined the CIA's role, he noted.

"We need to have somebody look into all this who's not appointed by or under the command of the secretary of defense. There is a multitude of investigations, but they're all within the Pentagon or a panel that was appointed by the secretary of defense," added Reed Brody, a lawyer with Human Rights Watch.

"To get the full truth, we need an independent investigation with the power to pick up the trail in Washington and to follow the facts wherever they lead," said Sen. Patrick Leahy of Vermont, top Democrat on the Senate Judiciary Committee.

The rights groups called for an independent probe to examine the actions of Pentagon officials, U.S. troops, CIA personnel and anyone else involved in or responsible for abuse, and they want a review of criminal liability of senior officials.

Amnesty International favors a special counsel. Human Rights Watch envisions an independent commission akin to the one that examined the Sept. 11, 2001, attacks.

A report on Tuesday by a panel appointed by Defense Secretary Donald Rumsfeld and headed by former Defense Secretary James Schlesinger assigned indirect responsibility for the abuse to top Pentagon civilian and military officials.

An investigative report by Army Maj. Gen. George Fay and Lt. Gen. Anthony Jones on Wednesday found that many more U.S. soldiers than previously acknowledged were directly involved in the Abu Ghraib abuse. Fay said some of the abuse qualified as torture.

More Pentagon investigations are ongoing.

-- Navy Vice Adm. Tom Church, the Navy's inspector general, is heading a review of Pentagon interrogation techniques and practices. It is expected to be completed by mid-September.

-- Army Brig. Gen. Richard Formica is looking into allegations of detainee abuse by elite U.S. special forces in Iraq. A senior Army official said this report should be out "soon," but was not more specific.

-- Army Col. Beverly Ertman, inspector general of the Army Reserve, is heading a review of training of Army Reserve military police and military intelligence soldiers in legal issues, detainee treatment, interrogation techniques, ethics and leadership. Army Reserve spokesman Steve Stromvall said this review is due to be finished by March 2005.

### **Tom Malione**

*Analyst for* Boundaries - Boundary Waters - Conservation - Environment - Fisheries - Human Rights - Maritime Matters

*Office of the Assistant Legal Adviser for Treaty Affairs (L/T)*

5420 HST

phone 202-647-1336 (direct)

fax 202-736-7541